**Effectiveness Monitoring Committee Meeting Notes**

**December 14, 2021 9:30 AM**

**GoToMeeting Webinar**

**1. Participants (11):**

Members Present - Sue Husari (Co-Chair), Ben Waitman, Jessica Leonard, Dr. Leander Love-Anderegg, Drew Coe, Jim Burke, Matt House, Sal Chinnici, Justin LaNier, Dr. Matt O’Connor, Peter Freer-Smith

Members Absent - Loretta Moreno (Co-Chair), Dr. Stacy Drury, Clarence Hostler

Staff - Dr. Kristina Wolf, Edith Hannigan, Andrew Lawhorn

Participants - Bill Short

**2. Report by the Co-Chairs**

**a. Member Updates:**

Co-chair Husari announced that the EMC needs to recruit two new members to fill behind two vacated seats (Greg Giusti - retired and Sarah Bisbing - resigned). Member Husari stated the Board of Forestry and Fire Protection (Board) will fill behind her seat around March 2022.

**b. Project Updates:**

EMC-2015-001: Class II-Large Monitoring from Caspar Creek and LaTour Demonstration State Forest – Member Coe just released the draft of the Statewide §1038(c)(6) monitoring report to the Board at the December meeting. Member Coe discussed the Completed Research Assessment and the Rule plead that took place in the Forest Practice Committee regarding the study limitations and how to effectively handle findings before presenting to the Board.

**3. Annual Report and Workplan**

- Dr. Wolf presented a draft of EMC Annual report and discussed sections from Executive Summary, Funding Section, Accomplishments, and Priorities.

Additional project updates were given to include in the Annual report and Workplan:

* The discussion regarding the project update given above (i.e., EMC-2015-001) in the Forest Practice Committee involves contemplation of a Class II-L rule change which was scheduled to sunset; this is a two-part rule where there is consideration for one part to be eliminated.
* Member House confirmed Dr. Lorraine Morella as the post-doc starting in 2022 on EMC Project-2018-006: Effect of FPRS on Restoring Canopy Closure, Water Temperature, & Primary Productivity.
* Member Coe will assist in place of Pete Cafferata for any updates that needs to be completed.

Sue Husari confirmed a deadline of close of business Friday, December 31, 2021 to provide updates for the Annual Report and Workplan.

**4. Discussion on Special Meeting of Related Research**

The EMC, in the near future, may have a virtual forum that brings together EMC-related projects. If EMC members would like to see any additional presentations, email Dr. Wolf with information about the research to be presented. Members Husari, Coe, and House were in agreement with having a special meeting to allow presentations of EMC-related research projects (i.e., not EMC-funded or -sponsored, but have the potential to impact the Forest Practice Rules and associated regulations, and could otherwise fall under the purview of the EMC’s research foci).

**5. Full Concept Proposal Review and Discussion**

**Aquatic Toxicity and Cumulative Watershed Effects of Pesticide Discharge Related to Post-Fire Reforestation (EMC-2021-001)**

* Member Short: no comments
* Member Burke: no comments
* Member House: had questions regarding the budget request and some of the operating expenses being included in that request for a reimbursement. Has uncertainty about how well, the committee can make inferences about the project, without having study sites delineated at this point, understanding what those practices, and evaluation of those practices.
* Member Chinnici: similar concerns as Member House; however, thought it was a great proposal.
* Member Love-Anderegg: addresses an area of high scientific uncertainty regarding compatibility of different sampling techniques.
* Member Freer-Smith: agreed with others. More Interested in the results than the methodological approach, and how the study would directly address critical monitoring questions.
* Member Waitman: no additional comments
* Member Leonard: shared concerns about the statement regarding pesticide detections and concentrations being compared to pesticide-use data, and toxicity benchmarks, where applicable. Would like further elaborations on how they intend to compare their results to what is applied in the watershed.
* Member Coe: concerned with this project because EMC is supposed to complete a feedback loop; however, authority for herbicide lies primarily with the Department of Pesticide Regulation, rather than the Board. He believes the plan proponents must address the cumulative effects of herbicide application in timber harvesting plans, not in emergencies. Also, felt the proposal was unclear about what is considered a match for the Water Board employees, and the contract amount being requested.
* Member LaNier: no concerns
* Chair Husari: need to ask the principal investigators to segment the total request into a three-year funding request and allocate by expense for each year. Also had a few concerns related to conclusions that could be drawn, and who is applying what and where.

**Evaluating the response of native pollinators to fuel-reduction treatments in managed conifer forests (EMC-2021-003)**

* Member House: no concerns
* Member Chinnici: really like the project and would approve funding
* Member Love-Anderegg: well put together proposal
* Member Burke: no concerns and would approve funding the proposal
* Member Freer-Smith: agrees with the comments that have come before and thinks it’s a strong proposal, which clearly addresses EMC critical monitoring questions
* Member Waitman: has questions regarding the geographic application and how it’s centered in a particular area. It's unclear how the proposal might relate to the Forest Practice Rules or what sort of recommendations might come out of it.
* Member Leonard: no additional comments different from others.
* Member Coe: most of comments have already been addressed and feels the proposal is strong
* Member LaNier: no further comments and supports funding
* Member Short: no additional from previous comments
* Chair Husari: would have liked if proposal could have added broadcast burning to the list of treatments; the three treatments that were considered are the most common in use at this time, and probably relate best to habitat for these insects. Will require work with the contracting staff related to preparing a scope of work, or the contracting staff to move forward with transferring of funding for this year.

Dr. Wolf advised members to open the Excel document she sent to them, and rank each of the projects separately over lunch; then email the excel documents back to her. Rankings will be posted online in the meeting materials.

Member Chinnici moved that we provide funding for both projects (EMC-2021-001 and EMC-2021-003) during this funding cycle (2021/22). Sue Husari second the motion.

Dr. Wolf called the question: The motion is for the EMC to recommend funding on both of the projects (EMC-2021-001 and EMC-2021-003) to the Board at their January 19th, 2022 meeting, with an amendment that this action assumes the EMC can spread the funding out over 2 to 3 years for the Water Boards project (EMC-2021-001).

**Vote Roll Call**

Love-Anderegg Aye

Freer-Smith Aye

Waitman Aye

Leonard Aye

Coe Aye

LaNier Abstain

Short Aye

Burke Aye

House Aye

Chinnici Aye

Drury Absent

Hostler Absent

Husari Aye

Moreno Absent

**Motion passes with one abstention.**

**6. Follow-up Discussion for EMC Project Liaisons**

None discussed.

**7. Public Forum**

None.

**8. Future Meeting Locations, Dates, and Agenda Items**

Chair Husari suggested sending out a poll for a future meeting. Dr. Wolf asked members to email her with proposed agenda items for a March or April meeting.

***Action item: Dr. Wolf will send a doodle poll to schedule the next meeting.***

**9.** **Announcements: Scientific Conferences, Symposiums, and Workshops**

* Member Coe stated that the California Licensed Forester’s Association (CLFA) is having an annual workshop in March; it will cover response and post fire reforestation issues in Anderson, California (south of Redding).
* Member Chinnici announced a western section of the Wildlife Society meeting in Reno; this will be a hybrid meeting with both in-person and online options, occurring in February.
* Member Love-Anderegg: The 8th California Oak Symposium, “Sustaining Oak Woodlands under Current and Future Conditions”, will occur in San Luis Obispo March 21 through 24.

**10.** **Adjourn**