

BOARD OF FORESTRY AND FIRE PROTECTION

THE NATURAL RESOURCES AGENCY
STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Keith Gilles, Chair

Wade Crowfoot, *Secretary*
Gavin Newsom, *Governor*

P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
(916) 653-8007
(916) 653-0989 FAX
[BOF Website \(www.bof.fire.ca.gov\)](http://www.bof.fire.ca.gov)



RANGE MANAGEMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, May 14th, 2019

Sacramento, CA

RMAC Members Present

Chair Marc Horney
Lesa Osterholm
Rich Ross
Andrée Soares
Bart Cremers
John Van Duyn
Sheryl Landrum

RMAC Members Absent

Russell Chamberlin
Don Watson
Katie Delbar, ex officio member
Lance Criley
Billie Roney

RMAC Staff

Brandi Goss

Department Staff

BOARD OF FORESTRY AND FIRE PROTECTION

THE NATURAL RESOURCES AGENCY
STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Keith Gilles, Chair

Wade Crowfoot, *Secretary*
Gavin Newsom, *Governor*

P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
(916) 653-8007
(916) 653-0989 FAX
[BOF Website \(www.bof.fire.ca.gov\)](http://www.bof.fire.ca.gov)



Items appear in the order they were presented on the agenda.

Report of Chair Marc Horney and RMAC Staff

Approve January and March 2019 Minutes Possible action item

No amendments were made to the minutes.

05-19-01 Member Ross moved to approve the January and March 2019 meeting minutes. Member Van Duyn seconded.

Roll Call Vote:

Van Duyn	Aye
Cremers	Aye
Landrum	Aye
Ross	Aye
Osterholm	Aye
Horney	Aye

The motion passed unanimously with five absences.

Approve 2019 Priorities Possible action item

The Committee discussed the Priorities extensively throughout the meeting and recommended some changes in phrasing in verb use.

05-19-02 Member Soares moved to approve the 2019 RMAC Priorities. Member Osterholm seconded.

Roll Call Vote:

Van Duyn	Aye
Cremers	Aye
Landrum	Aye
Ross	Aye
Soares	Aye
Osterholm	Aye
Horney	Aye

The motion passed unanimously with four absences.

P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
(916) 653-8007
(916) 653-0989 FAX
[BOF Website \(www.bof.fire.ca.gov\)](http://www.bof.fire.ca.gov)



05-19-03 Member Soares moved to extend the 2019 RMAC Priorities through the 2020 and 2021 calendar years, allowing appropriate revisions as needed. Member Landrum seconded.

Roll Call Vote:

Van Duyn	Aye
Cremers	Aye
Landrum	Aye
Ross	Aye
Soares	Aye
Osterholm	Aye
Horney	Aye

The motion passed unanimously with four absences.

Annotated Bibliography of Rangeland Research

Member Criley's updates on Post-Fire Bibliography

Ms. Goss summarized the update email received from member Criley as he was unable to attend the meeting. Member Criley is reaching out to Matthew Shapiro and has done a thorough search of the scientific literature. His search indicates that there are significant gaps in the scientific literature related to post-fire grazing practices and that additional research is needed. Chair Horney echoed this sentiment based on conversations he has had with academic peers.

Tracy Schohr brought up concerns about weed invasions follow severe fire if grazing is postponed for too long.

The Water Quality and Targeted Grazing bibliography items are still in progress. Some resources are available on Leslie Roche's website. Staff will be reaching out to CRCC presenters and others and Chair Horney will be asking for student support to assist in developing these bibliographies.

Initial discussion of a theme and topics for the September Workshop

The Committee discussed the focus of invitations to the workshop and who should be involved to most effectively increase agency knowledge regarding grazing as a fuels reduction tool.

Ms. Goss introduced three possible workshop "themes" for the Committee to consider. The Committee decided to have the workshop incorporate aspects of the "General Grazing" Theme and the "Fire Prevention/Fuels Reduction" Theme to create a workshop that introduces attendees to grazing as a management tool and then discusses its applicability for fuel reduction and post-fire recovery. Member Osterholm suggested a name for the workshop – "Sustainable Vegetation Management." The Committee also discussed the applicability of a presentation regarding feasible regulatory implementation of programs to support vegetation management that includes grazing and is landowner based. Members Osterholm

P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
(916) 653-8007
(916) 653-0989 FAX
[BOF Website \(www.bof.fire.ca.gov\)](http://www.bof.fire.ca.gov)



and Landrum volunteered to assist in the development of an outline and outreach strategy for the Fall Workshop.

The Committee also extensively discussed the inclusion of educational materials that can be distributed to attendees. Staff will reach out to a number of organizations that may have existing materials such as UCCE, CRCC, USFS, etc.

The Committee tentatively suggested having an August meeting to complete all preparation for the Fall Workshop.

Grazing and fire prevention

The Committee discussed the development of some comparisons between public and privately managed lands as well as land trusts with relation to fire severity and the impacts of grazing on fire severity. Member Osterholm suggested reaching out to individuals from the CRCC Summit who discussed this issue extensively.

Update on Grants and the Inclusion of Grazing as an Allowable Activity

NRCS Call - Ms. Goss provided an update on NRCS's use of grazing in forested landscapes and suggested that RPF outreach and developing a connection between CRMs and RPFs may be a good route to improve utilization.

CFIP

Ms. Goss provided an update on CFIP's allowance of grazing as a reimbursable practice and suggested again that RPF outreach may be needed to bridge the gap. Presentations for organizations like CFLA and SAF may be a good route to begin addressing these issues.

The Committee expressed that CRMs should be involved in the education and a process should be established for including CRMs in a consulting role when RPFs want to include grazing prescriptions.

Reference List of Agencies and Individuals Using/Providing Grazing Services

Outreach to potential hosting agencies and contributors - Stephanie Larson is working on producing a state-wide list of contract grazers and an associated "review" system for grazers. This list will be organized by species and region, and a public outreach effort will accompany the release so that landowners know how to hire contract grazers and how to identify what species of animal is needed for their resource goals. She is also considering developing education tools for smaller grazers who may want to develop a targeted grazing business and a draft contract for landowners and targeted grazers to use. Stephanie is collaborating with Bob Gillaspay from NRCS to consider providing EQUIP funding for infrastructure to accomplish targeted grazing, and is considering a "home base" aspect to the program where grazers could host their animals on public or private land that would not require a lease in the off-season. She is also involved in a CAL FIRE Grant to

P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
(916) 653-8007
(916) 653-0989 FAX
[BOF Website \(www.bof.fire.ca.gov\)](http://www.bof.fire.ca.gov)



help landowners make decisions about fuel treatments – e.g. prescribed fire, targeted grazing, or trimming.

The Committee supports the creation of such a list and particularly the landowner outreach and education that Stephanie has proposed.

SPI summary

Ms. Goss discussed the information gathered regarding SPI's use of grazing on forested land and distributed a summary document provided by one of their re-forestation managers and a document released by SPI following a fire on SPI land that discussed post-fire grazing.

Staff was directed to investigate the use of grazing within the industrial timber industry further and specifically to see if grazing exclusions during the first year of tree growth are based on studies, or anecdotal evidence.

Forest Management Task Force, Landowner Outreach and Education Work Group

Ms. Goss discussed providing outreach materials and/or the list of targeted grazers to the Work Group to assist in their outreach related to fire prevention.

Update on Grazing on State Forests and Associated Research Efforts

Chair Horney and Ms. Goss discussed the conversations that have been facilitated related to grazing on State Forests, grazing demonstration projects, and associate research efforts. Kevin Conway, State Forest Manager, will be releasing a bid for a consultant to amend the State Forest Vegetation Management Programs for two State Forests so that grazing can be included appropriately. Following completion of these updates he will be putting animals on the landscape, approximately in 2021. Several individuals from UCCE and other organizations participated in a call discussing how to include research in the State Forest grazing projects.

Post-Fire BMP Investigation

Current BMPs

Staff and Chair Horney are still pursuing current BMPs, but have been unable to find any scientific research addressing post-fire BMPs.

Identification of missing BMPs

Development of comprehensive BMPs for use and distribution

Ms. Goss discussed outreach to Dr. Leslie Roche regarding Post-Fire BMPs and her development of a bibliography. She also discussed outreach to soil scientists regarding hydrophobic post-fire soils.

Water Quality

Discussion of 303d Listing Process Training

Ms. Goss discussed the 303(d) Listing Process Training that was attended by her and Ms. Hannigan. She discussed the ability to submit public data and publicly

BOARD OF FORESTRY AND FIRE PROTECTION

THE NATURAL RESOURCES AGENCY
STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Keith Gilles, Chair

Wade Crowfoot, *Secretary*

Gavin Newsom, *Governor*

P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
(916) 653-8007
(916) 653-0989 FAX
[BOF Website \(www.bof.fire.ca.gov\)](http://www.bof.fire.ca.gov)



comment on listings. The Committee expressed several concerns, and Ms. Goss will be following up with water board staff to identify more specifically how water bodies are listed and de-listed and what scientific literature is being used to support those decisions.

Updates from partner organizations & Public Forum

Member Soares spoke on behalf of the California Wool Grower's Association regarding a bill that may negatively impact sheep owners. She asked for a letter of support from RMAC for their actions related to this bill, and a vote was taken in support of the letter development. Subsequent discussion with the Board of Forestry and Fire Protection's Counsel revealed that this item could not be voted on at this meeting, and the vote was discarded.

Staff from the Central Valley, Lahontan, and State Water Boards were present at the RMAC meeting. RMAC members and Water Board staff discussed the development of the non-point source permit, the process for identifying the source of water quality impacts, financial pressures on rangeland owners related to permitting, the management of rangelands for multiple objectives while taking trade-offs into consideration, and outreach efforts that can assist in improving water quality on rangelands.

The Committee and the Water Board staff agreed that RMAC would participate in stakeholder meetings for the development of the non-point source permit and that Water Board staff would regularly participate in RMAC meetings.

Grazing and Fire Prevention

Craig Ostergaard, Reforestation Manager for the Southern District of Sierra Pacific Industries (SPI), spoke about SPI's use of grazing animals for fire prevention on SPI land. They have utilized cattle for years in a variety of situations and are currently working on a lease for goats and sheep to clear new fuel breaks which would later be maintained with cattle. He also discussed the applicability of livestock management techniques for mitigating water quality impacts which lead into a discussion of adaptive management.

The Committee discussed the development of the CalVTP and the inclusion of grazing as a treatment method.

Updates from Partner Organizations & Public Forum

No updates were offered during the public forum.

Meeting Adjourned